

GOV1521
Bureaucratic Politics:
Government, Military,
Social and Economic Organizations

Professor Daniel Carpenter
Harvard University

Lecture 2

Announcements

Office Hours: Wednesday 3-5PM, in Knafel 430

Course Home Page [syllabus, lecture notes]:
<http://people.hmdc.harvard.edu/~dcarpent/burpols/burpols.html>

Undergraduate research opportunities [paid] for this summer; see me after lecture today or Thurs

Puzzles

- When R. S. McNamara was SOD in 1960s, he raised budget but was disliked by military brass. When Melvin Laird was SOD in 1970s, he cut budget but was liked by the brass. Why?
- The USAF jealously guards its command of ICBMs. But when ICBM was first proposed, Air Force was indifferent and hostile. Why?
- When the TVA was created in the 1930s, it was attacked by conservatives because it threatened the well-being of private electric utilities. Within a few decades it was being criticized by liberals because it behaved just like a private utility. Why?
- When local police chief is appointed to improve quality, crime rate rarely goes down but number of traffic tickets issued and arrest rate go up. Why?

Halperin: The Case of Skybolt

Skybolt is air-to-surface missile developed in 1950s and 1960s, with nuclear capability.

“Each of the main bureaucracies engaged in foreign policy in Washington became involved, but every separate organization saw the issue from its own perspective. Having different interests and perceptions, different bureaucrats took a different stand on what should be done.”

The Players and the Interests

- Charles Hitch [DOD Comptroller]:
- USAF:
- SOD [McNamara]:
- State Department:
- Secretary of State Dean Rusk:
- President [JFK/LBJ]:

The Players and the Interests

- Charles Hitch [DOD Comptroller]: Budgetary matter
- USAF: How does this influence our mission, our essence, our budget?
- SOD [McNamara]: can I *demonstrate* cost-effective budgeting?
- State Department: officials not thrilled about independent nuke capacity for UK [why should we be funding it as opposed to strengthening our own?]
- Secretary of State Dean Rusk: cancellation threat to US-UK relations [his audience is different]
- President [JFK/LBJ]: Worried about UK relations, but also about his own relations with DOD.

Why Bureaucratic Politics Matters

Bureaucrats Often Value Autonomy More than Money/Resources

1961: SOD Robert S. McNamara hikes budget but limits control; backlash

1969: SOD Melvin Laird reduces budget but increases lower-level control; improved morale

Organizational Morale

- An ill-defined concept, seems to capture motivation, esteem, culture, even ethical dimensions.
- Yet seems to be a common referent among org leaders and members, perhaps with explanatory utility.
- Example: Army's resistance to extending tours of duty for senior Cos in Vietnam. Worried about erosion of morale for longer tours of duty.

Focus on Essence [Identity]

- Modern buzzphrase: "What are our core competencies?"
- USAF: Combat flying (**not airlift**)
- Army: ground combat (not air defense, advisory/peacekeeping, or special units)
- Navy: naval combat (**not sealift**)
 - Flyers (brown shoe)
 - Others (black shoe)
 - Submariners
 - Missile-firing submarines
- Foreign Service: representation and diplomacy, not policy analysis
- CIA: split btw analysis and intelligence

Implications: Turf Battles

- USAF and Navy want primacy in air combat and tactical/strategic bombing.
 - USAF willing to kill new technologies so that Navy doesn't get further inroads.
 - Vietnam: Navy makes major inroads to strategic bombing campaigns.
- Army wants say in, control over, air support for combat missions.
- CIA and Army fight over control of U-2 spy plane operations.

Implications: Turf Battles

- Sometimes new technology promotes bureaucratic conflict. MRBMs: Who will get to control and deploy these toys? USAF or Army?
- Intelligence: how independent should Army intelligence be?
- Combat: how intensively should U.S. rely on airstrikes versus ground troop operations?
- Not just "self-interest," but national interest understood [visualized, felt] in terms of organizational identity and interest. Participants can't see it any other way. Organizational identities and interests frame the issue for them. ORG COGNITION.

Implications: Differences in Position by Hierarchy

- Extension of duty: civilian versus military careerists.
- New weapons system: military officials might want it. SOD might worry about another audience he must face: Congress/President, and budgetary efficiency mandate.

Robert McNamara on budget pressure in nuclear weapons development

There is a kind of mad momentum intrinsic to the development of all new nuclear weaponry. If a weapon system works—and works well—there is strong pressure from many directions to procure and deploy the weapon out of all proportion to the prudent level required.

The danger in deploying this relatively light and reliable Chinese-oriented ABM system is going to be that pressures will develop to expand it into a heavy Soviet-oriented ABM system.

We must resist that temptation firmly—not because we can for a moment afford to relax our vigilance against a possible Soviet first-strike—but precisely because our greatest deterrent against such a strike is not a massive, costly, but highly penetrable ABM shield, but rather a fully credible offensive assured destruction capability.

The so-called heavy ABM shield—at the present state of technology—would in effect be no adequate shield at all against a Soviet attack, but rather a strong inducement for the Soviets to vastly increase their own offensive forces. That, as I have pointed out, would make it necessary for us to respond in turn—and so the arms race would rush hopelessly on to no sensible purpose on either side.⁵

Wilson: Puzzles

- When the TVA was created in the 1930s, it was attacked by conservatives because it threatened the well-being of private electric utilities. Within a few decades it was being criticized by liberals because it behaved just like a private utility. Why?
- When R. S. McNamara was SOD in 1960s, he raised budget but was disliked by military brass. When Melvin Laird was SOD in 1970s, he cut budget but was liked by the brass. Why?
- The USAF jealously guards its command of ICBMs. But when ICBM was first proposed, Air Force was indifferent and hostile. Why?
- When local police chief is appointed to improve quality, crime rate rarely goes down but number of traffic tickets issued and arrest rate go up. Why?

Halperin/Wilson: Principles

1. **People are functions of their roles.** Simon: “If organization is inessential, if all we need is the man, why do we insist on creating a position for the man?”
2. **Preferences depend on position.**
 - Rank-and-file: behavior contingent on context and belief/culture
 - Managers: resource constraints, and type of agency
 - Executives: turf

Some Org History

Professionalization from clubs to teams in late 19th century. Clubs get property rights over players, including right of sale, transfer, reassignment.

1894: Western League to oppose National League

1901: becomes American League. Leagues operate first WS

General Org Structure

Game Manager backed up by Coaches

- the *first base coach*;
- the *third base coach*;
- the *bench coach*;
- the *pitching coach*;
- the *hitting coach*;
- the *bullpen coach*.

Player-managers and player-coaches until early 20th century; then full-time coaches, beginning with base coaches


Team Hierarchy (above playing manager)

Partial inversion of Weberian principles. Greatest differentiation and hierarchy occurs among owners/managers

Team President (e.g., Thomas A. Yawkey, 1933-1976)

VP and General Manager (e.g., Eddie Collins, 1933-; hired from Philadelphia) – nemesis in NY, Edward Barrow

Bucky Harris
By Shirley Povich
Chapter Fourteen



Bucky Harris (left) and Joe Judge, pictured in 1946 when their managerial careers were revived with Harris leading the Red Sox and Judge managing Washington.

Some Treasures of Baseball History by Newspaper

***Yankees Voted Top
1942 Disappointment***

**Brooklyn's Kicking Away 10-Game Lead Gets
Close Second Vote as Leading 'Floperoo'**

By Sid Feder

New York, Dec. 21.—The New York Yankees had to come roaring down the stretch to beat out Brooklyn's hardworking and havelorned Dodgers for the honor, but it is no official.—The Yanks are the biggest sports disappointment of 1942.

By a narrow, but convincing, vote the Nation's sports writers decided

Today that the fold-up of the American League champions in the World Series constituted a better "Floperoo" than the terrific success the Duffness Boys from the Gemenas had in blowing a 10-game lead and kissing the National League permanent good-bye. So, by a margin of 90 points to 74 1/2 for the Dodgers, the sports writers had-ling in the annual Associated Press poll on the "honor" awarded the yearly prize of a pair of second earmuffs to the Yanks.

Division of Labor within Game

Pre-modern era: no "bullpen," no "middle-reliever, but ace-closers did exist (development of specialized relief pitchers in 1950s).

Key difference with Weberian bureaucracy: not generally formalized
UNLESS...

Closer contracts (Aurelio Rodriguez, Tigers, 1984-86)

Emergence of Minor League System

Implicit hierarchies before 1963. "Minors" date to 1880s.

Formal organization: National Association of Professional Baseball Leagues (1901 agreement with MLB).

Important development of farm "system" within St. Louis Cardinals org in 1950s.

TABLE 1.1. Minor League Classifications, 2002

Classification	Definition	Years in Use
AAA	The highest level in the minor leagues	1946 to present
AA	An intermediate level	1912 to present
A	Entry level	1902 to present
Rookie	Primarily for first-year players	1963 to present
Independent	Leagues not affiliated with the National Association of Professional Baseball Leagues or Major League Baseball	

Source: Lloyd Johnson and Miles Wolff, eds., *The Encyclopedia of Minor League Baseball*, Second Edition (Durham, NC: Baseball America, Inc., 1997), p. 11.
